

[Page 415]

**PART FOUR—FINDING, DISCUSSION AND NARRATIVE REGARDING  
CERTAIN SENSITIVE NATIONAL SECURITY MATTERS**

**20. Finding:** [Through its investigation, the Joint Inquiry developed information suggesting specific sources of foreign support for some of the September 11 hijackers while they were in the United States. The Joint Inquiry’s review confirmed that the Intelligence Community also has information, much of which has yet to be independently verified, concerning these potential sources of support. In their testimony, neither CIA nor FBI officials were able to address definitively the extent of such support for the hijackers globally or within the United States or the extent to which such support, if it exists, is knowing or inadvertent in nature. Only recently, and at least in part due to the Joint Inquiry’s focus on this issue, did the FBI and CIA strengthen their efforts to address these issues. In the view of the Joint Inquiry, this gap in U.S. intelligence coverage is unacceptable, given the magnitude and immediacy of the potential risk to U.S. national security. The Intelligence Community needs to address this area of concern as aggressively and as quickly as possible].

Discussion: [The Joint Inquiry reviewed information in FBI and CIA documents suggesting specific potential sources of foreign support for the September 11 hijackers. While the Joint Inquiry uncovered this material during the course of its review of FBI and CIA documents, it did not attempt to investigate and assess the accuracy and significance of this information independently, recognizing that such a task would be beyond the scope of the Joint [page 416] Inquiry. Instead, the Joint Inquiry referred a detailed compilation of information it had uncovered in documents and interviews to the FBI and CIA for further investigation by the Intelligence Community and, if appropriate, law enforcement agencies. A detailed summary of the available information pertaining to this issue is included in the classified version of the Joint Inquiry final report].

[It should be clear that this Joint Inquiry has made no final determinations as to the reliability or sufficiency of the information regarding these issues that was found contained in FBI and CIA documents. It was not the task of this Joint Inquiry to conduct the kind of extensive investigation that would be required to determine the true significance of such alleged support to the hijackers. On the one hand, it is possible that these kinds of connections could suggest, as indicated in a CIA memorandum, “incontrovertible evidence that there is support for these terrorists [—————].” On the other hand, it is also possible that further

investigation of these allegations could reveal legitimate, and innocent, explanations for these associations].

[Given the serious national security implications of this information, however, the leadership of the Joint Inquiry is referring the Joint Inquiry Staff's compilation of relevant information to both the FBI and the CIA for investigative review and appropriate investigative and intelligence action].

[Page 416]

[\_\_\_\_\_]  
\_\_\_\_\_].

[\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_]:

- [\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_]



\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_];

[Page 418]

- [\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_]; and

- [\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_].

[\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_] , including:

- [\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_];

- [\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_];

- [\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_]

\_\_\_\_\_];

- [\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_];

- [\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_] ]  
[\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_].

[\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_

---

---

\_\_\_\_\_].

**NARRATIVE**

[\_\_\_\_\_]

[\_\_\_\_\_]

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

\_\_\_\_\_].

[\_\_\_\_\_]

---

---

---

---

---

\_\_\_\_\_].

[\_\_\_\_\_]

---

---

---

---

---

\_\_\_\_\_].

[\_\_\_\_\_]

---

---

---

---

[page 421]

—].

[

]

[

—].

[

—].

[

—]

[

—];

- 

[

—];

[Page 422]

- [\_\_\_\_\_] ; and
- [\_\_\_\_\_] .

[\_\_\_\_\_]

[\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_].

[\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_ : \_\_\_\_\_]

\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_].

[Page 423]

[\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_

<sup>1</sup> [\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_].”



\_\_\_\_\_];

- [\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_];

- [\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_];

- [\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_];

- [\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_];

- [\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_].

[\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_

[page 424] \_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_].

[\_\_\_\_\_]

\_\_\_\_\_]:

[\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_]

[\_\_\_\_\_]

\_\_\_\_\_].

[\_\_\_\_\_]

\_\_\_\_\_].

[Page 425]

[\_\_\_\_\_]

\_\_\_\_\_]:

[\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_].

[\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_]

[\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_].

[\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_].

[Page 426]

[\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_].

The Joint Inquiry also found, [\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_] :

- [\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_] ;

- [\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_] ;”

- [\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_] ;

- [\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_] ;

[Page 427]

- [\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_] .

[\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_]

\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_].

[\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_].

[\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_].

[Page 428]

[\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_]:  
[\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_].

[\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_]:  
[\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_].

[\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_]

[\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_].

[\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_]

[\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_ [page  
429] \_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_].

[\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_].

[\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_].

[\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_].

[Page 430]

[\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_].

[\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_]

[\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_].

[\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_].

[\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_ [Page

431] \_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_].

[\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_



\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_]

[\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_].

[\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_]:

[\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
[page 432] \_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_]

[\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_].

[\_\_\_\_\_]

[\_\_\_\_\_].

[\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_].

[Page 433]

[\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_].<sup>2</sup>

\_\_\_\_\_].<sup>2</sup>

<sup>2</sup>[\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_].

[\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_].

[\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_ [page

434] \_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_].”

In testimony before the Joint Inquiry, [\_\_\_\_\_]:

[\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_].

[\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_].

[\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

[redacted]

[redacted]

[Page 435]

[redacted]

[redacted]

[redacted]

[\_\_\_\_\_]  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_].

[\_\_\_\_\_ [page  
436] \_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_].

[A U. S. Government official testified about [\_\_\_\_\_]:

[\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_]

\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_].

[\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_]:

[\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_].

Finally, [\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_ [page

437] \_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_].

[\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_].

[\_\_\_\_\_]

[\_\_\_\_\_]

\_\_\_\_\_ [page  
438] \_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_].

[\_\_\_\_\_]

\_\_\_\_\_].

[\_\_\_\_\_]

\_\_\_\_\_].

[\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_]

[Page 439]

[\_\_\_\_\_] A U.S. Government official testified to the Joint Inquiry on this issue]:

[\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_]

[\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_]



\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_].

[\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_].

[A U. S. Government official testified at the [\_\_\_\_\_] hearing about [\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_]: [page 440]

[\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_].

Mr. Bereuter: [\_\_\_\_\_]?

U. S. Government official: [\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_].

[\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_]

[\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_]

\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_].

[\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_]:  
  [\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_].

[Page 441]

[\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_]:  
  [\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_].

[\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_].

[\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_]:  
  [\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_]

[\_\_\_\_\_]  
\_\_\_\_\_].

[\_\_\_\_\_]:  
[\_\_\_\_\_].

[\_\_\_\_\_]:  
[\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
[page 442] \_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_].

[\_\_\_\_\_]:  
[\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_].

[\_\_\_\_\_]:  
[\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_].

[\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_]

[\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_] ].

[Page 443]

[\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_] :  
[\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_] ].

[\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_] :  
[\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_] ].

In the October 10, 2002 closed hearing, FBI Director Mueller acknowledged that he became aware of some of the facts regarding this issue only as a result of the investigative work of the Joint Inquiry Staff:

I'm saying the sequence of events here, I think the staff probed and, as a result of the probing, some facts came to light here and to me, frankly, that had not come to light before, and perhaps would not have come to light had the staff not probed. That's what I'm telling you. So I'm agreeing with you that the staff probing brought out facts that may not have come to this Committee.

Senator DeWine: But what you're also saying, though, is that that probing then brought facts to your attention.

Director Mueller: Yes.